

KAVRAMLAR VE KURAMLAR -Düşünce Bilimleri-

Baş Editör

M. Nesim Doru-Kamuran Gökdağ

Cilt Editörleri

Yunus Cengiz

İbrahim Deniz

Necip Uyanık

İbrahim Halil Çetres



MARDİN ARTUKLU ÜNİVERSİTESİ YAYINLARI



Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi Yayınları

Kavramlar ve Kuramlar
Düşünce Bilimleri

Baş Editör
M. Nesim Doru-Kamuran Gökdağ

Cilt Editörleri
Yunus Cengiz
İbrahim Deniz
Necip Uyanık
İbrahim Halil Çetres

İç Düzen ve Kapak Tasarım
Abdullah Özgür Oral

Matbaa Sertifika No: 44676

Birinci Baskı
Aralık 2020
Mardin

ISBN
978-605-4202-62-1

Baskı-Cilt
Mardin Sesi Gazetecilik Matbaacılık Yayıncılık
Amb. Dağ. San. ve Tic. Ltd. Şti.
0482 213 16 56 - 212 11 58

Copyright© Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi Yayınları
Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi, Artuklu Yerleşkesi, Diyarbakır Yolu
Artuklu / Mardin
Tel : +90 482 2134002 • Fax : +90 482 2134004
web : www.artuklu.edu.tr

Yayımlanan yazıların hukuki sorumluluğu yazarlarına aittir.



Bu eser GAP Bölge Kalkınma İdaresi Başkanlığı'nın katkılarıyla basılmıştır.

İÇİNDEKİLER

METAFİZİK VE DİN

Bir Sınır Kavram Olarak Khora ve Hayal	
M. Nesim Doru.....	3
Klasik Dönem İslam Filozofları İlim Tasniflerinde Metafizik: Konusu ve Diğer İlimlerle İlişkisi	
Kamuran Gökdağ.....	15
İzutsu'nun Okumasıyla İbn Arabî'nin Fusûs'unda Tasavvuf Dili: 'Mutlak Varlık'ın Bir İfadesi Olarak Tecellî	
İlyas Özdemir.....	37
İbn Arabî'nin Varlık Anlayışı Bağlamında Âlemdeki Bilgi Kaynakları ve İnsan-ı Kâmilin Yorumlayıcılık Özelliği	
Sezin Büyükmenekşe.....	61
İnsan-Tanrı Diyalogunun Kadim Bir Örneği: Minu-yi Hired	
Mehmet Mekin Meçin.....	73
Etimolojik Açıdan Ölümsüzlük Problemi	
Abdullah Pakoğlu.....	91

TOPLUM VE SİYASET

Filozof, Muhalif ve Sosyo-Politik Sınırlar: Özgürlük ve Erdemlilik İlişkisi Bağlamında Fârâbî ve İbn Bâcce'de Nevâbit Kavramı	
Kamuran Gökdağ.....	103
Pozitivist Bir Evren İnşası: Tevfik Fikret'in Şiirlerinde Pozitivist Ütopya	
Beyhan Kanter.....	121
Emile Durkheim'da Toplumsal Düzen Tartışması	
İbrahim Yücedağ.....	135
Michel Foucault'da Dil ve İktidar	
Himmet Hülür & Hamit Ölçer.....	151
Adalet Kavramının Eşanlamlısı Olarak Meşveret	
Alpaslan Akkurt.....	163
Carl Schmitt'te Bir Sınır Kavram Olarak Egemenlik	
İbrahim Deniz.....	179
مفهوم اللغة الاجتماعي عند علي عبد الواحد وافي	
محمد الفارس.....	187
مكانة ابن خلدون بين علماء الاجتماع والاقتصاد وأثره في الفكر الغربي (المنظومة المفاهيمية)	
سمير الشيخ علي.....	213

الإطار القانوني الناظم لوجود اللاجئين السوريين في تركيا بين الواقع والطموح وسام الدين العكلة	239
---	-----

PSİKOLOJİ VE AHLÂK

Yeni Bir Bilim Olarak Felsefi Sağaltım ve Pratik İmkânları Şahin Filiz&Zhanat Zhanbeyeva	253
Metafizik, Epistemolojik ve Psikolojik Boyutuyla Vicdan Kavramı Anar Gafarov	269
İsyan Ahlakı'nın İzlerini Öğretmede Aramak: Nurettin Topçu'da Öğretmen Ahlakı Muhammed Öz	399
Yaşlılık Kuramları Bağlamında Yaşlılığın Anlam Değişimi Deniz Işiker Bedir	309

BİLİM VE MANTIK

Einstein ve Popper Ekseninde Kuramın Öncel(1)iği Rafiz Manafov & Zehra Oruk Akman	323
Özellikler, Bağıntı ve Süreklilik Sorunu A. Suat Gözcü	339
Radyolojinin Tıp Bilim Düşüncesinin Değişimine Etkisi Safiye Kafadar & Hüseyin Kafadar	347
Mantık Biliminin Sınırları İbrahim Halil Çetres.....	357

DİL VE KAVRAMLAR

Hayat ve Ölümün Sınırlarında Yazı Yazmak Yunus Cengiz	367
Fârâbî Felsefesinde Dil, Düşünce ve Kavramda Evrim (Kitâbu'l-Hurûf Bağlamında) Adil Koyuncu.....	377
İhvân-ı Safâ Risâlelerinde Cüz'î/Tikel Akıl Kavramı Nusret Taş	397
Osmanlı Müziğinde Usûle Dair Kavramlar Muhammed Aydın	421
Dil, Bilim ve Din Açısından Gelenek Kavramı Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme Safa Demir Sarı.....	437

İletişim Dilinde Sıkça Karıştırılan Empati ve Sempati Kavramları Üzerine

Sezergül Yıkılmış..... 451

TARİH VE KÜLTÜR

Protestanlığın Yayılmasında Osmanlı Etkisi: Kanunî Sultan Süleyman Dönemi (1520-1566)

Feridun Bilgin..... 463

The Language-Building for the Nation-Building: Martin Hartmann's Discourse on the Ottoman Literature and Language Purification Attempts

Remzi Avcı..... 487

İran Mitolojisinde Cinsiyet Eşitliği

Pouneh Abdollahifard..... 499

Modern Dönemde Türkiye ve İran'da Dil ve Milliyetçilik Düşüncesinin Gelişimi: Ziya Gökalp ve Ahmed Kesrevî Üzerinden Mukayeseli Bir Perspektif

Mehmet Akif Koç..... 513

دور المرأة الأندلسية في ازدهار الحركة الفكرية

نرجس كدرو 535

ARKEOLOJİ VE ANTROPOLOJİ

Antropolojik Bir Bulguyla Akıl Yetisini Sosyolojik Olarak Yorumlama İmkânı: Aklın Somut Bir Göstergesi Olarak Âkûlê ve Aklın Rolü

Halit Yeşilmen 567

Intra- and Intercommunal Rituals in the Upper Mesopotamian Pre-Pottery Neolithic: The Beginning of Organized Religion?

Abu B. Siddiq & Vecihi Özkaya..... 585

Uzak Geçmişimizi Bugüne Uyarlamak: Neolitik Dönem

İnançlarını İdeolojik Okumak Üzerine Bazı Değerlendirmeler

Bilal Toprak..... 607

İnanç Sembolizminde Kutsal Bir Varlık Olarak Su: Adıyaman Örneği Üzerinden Bir İnceleme

Tekin Çifçi..... 619

من الأنثروبولوجيا الدلالية إلى علم الدلالة الأنثروبولوجي (دراسة حيوية في خلق الإنسان ونشأة اللغة بين البيولوجيا والميتولوجيا)

مهنا بلال الرشيد 639

EĞİTİM VE PEDAGOJİ

A Case Study: A Learner's English Language Learning Journey Examining Personal, Motivational and Socio-Cultural Factors Serap Yıldız.....	659
Liderlikte Yeni Bir Yaklaşım: Erdemli Liderlik ve Okul Müdürlerinin Erdemli Liderlik Davranışlarının İncelenmesi Mehmet Yiğit& Bünyamin Ağalday	679
Körlük ve Bilgelik: Üç Film Analizi Bağlamında Bir Değerlendirme Yunus Bucuka	719
Hüsn-ü Zan ve Su-i Zan Kavramlarını Sosyal Biliş Kuramı Bağlamında Analiz Etmek Akif Akto	737
Dil Gelişiminin Matematiksel Düşünme Üzerindeki Etkisi Cemil İnan	763

ENTELEKTÜEL VE ÂLİM

Ali Şerîatî'nin Düşünceleri Çerçevesinde Aydın Kavramına Dair Bir Değerlendirme Adnan Çetin.....	781
İslamcı Bir Yazar Şule Yüksel Şenler ve <i>Seher Vakti</i> Dergisi Ahmet İşler.....	793
Düşüncüyü Aydınlatmak: Bir Âlim Portresi Olarak Gazalî Seher Oral	809
Dreyfus Davası ve Entelektüel Tartışmaları Sümeyra Güloğlu Hasar.....	819

ÇAĞDAŞ DÜŞÜNCE VE VAROLUŞÇULUK

Yaşam ve Ölümün Varoluşsal Sınırında Kierkegaard'da İnsan Kavramı Necip Uyanık.....	835
Deleuze ve Guattari'de Köksapsal Düşünce Hamit Ölçer & Himmet Hülür	849
An Existentialist Approach to Jean-Paul Sartre's <i>No Exit</i> Halit Alkan.....	863
Muhammed İkbâl'e Göre Din Mümkün Müdür? Yasin Gökhan	871
Baudrillard'da Tüketim Ögesi Olarak İmleyemeyen İmge İdris Kılıç	883

TAKDİM

Üniversitemiz kurulduğu günden bugüne içinde bulunduğu coğrafyanın tarihsel mirasını insanlığın dikkat ve hizmetine sunmak üzere başta sosyal bilimler alanında olmak üzere önemli çalışmalar yapmaktadır. Üniversitemiz söz konusu coğrafyayla bir aidiyet ilişkisi içinde olmakla birlikte sadece bu ilişkiyle de kendini sınırlandırmamaktadır. Bu çerçevede tarihsel ve kültürel mirasımızı beynelmilel alanlarda tedavüle sokmak gibi bir misyonu da üstlenmiştir. Elinizde bulunan çalışma bu misyonun pratikteki örneklerinden sadece biridir.

Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi genelde sosyal bilimler özelde ise Dil, Düşünce ve Din Bilimleri alanlarında iddiası olan bir kurumdur. Üniversitemiz içinde bulunduğu kadim coğrafyanın kadim mirasının her bir ürününü tabiri caizse kutsal saymakta ve onu yaşatmak için büyük bir azim ve gayret içinde hareket etmektedir. Arkaik veya aktüel, tarihsel veya güncel, klasik veya modern olsun bu coğrafyada akıl-ca tasavvur edilen her düşünce, idrak ve inşa edilip üretilen her kavram, dil-ce beyan ve telaffuz edilen her kelime ve sözcük, gönül-ce müşahede edilen her kanı ve inanç üniversitemizin ilgi alanlarına girmekte ve bilim insanlarının dikkatine sunulmaktadır.

Üniversitemiz belli disiplinler alanına hapsolup bilgi üretmeyi sığ ve yüzeysel bulan bir anlayış içerisinde çalışmalar yapmakta ve inter-disipliner bir bakış açısını gerekli görmekte beraber bilgiyi kümülatif ve insanlığın ortak malı olarak gören bir hikmet anlayışı içerisinde meta-disipliner bir metodoloji geliştirmeyi hedeflemektedir. Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi bu yaklaşım tarzını en fazla sosyal bilimler alanında ortaya koymuş ve koymaya devam etmektedir.

Elinizdeki çalışma yukarıda ifade ettiğim çerçevede oluşmuş bir projenin ürünüdür. Aralık 2018 yılında üniversitemiz tarafından basılan editoryal kitap çalışmasında Dil, Düşünce ve Din Bilimleri Klasik Sorunlar ve Güncel Tartışmalar çerçevesinde ele alınmıştır. Bu çalışmada ise aynı alanlar bazında Kavramlar ve Kuramlar çerçevesinde birbirinden önemli ve ilgi çekici çalışmalar yine bir editoryal çalışmada bir araya getirilmiştir. Üniversitemizin bu projesi gelecek sene sözkonusu alanların Kurum ve Okulları ve nihayet Kişi ve Eserleri üzerinden devam edecektir.

Bu projede yer alan başta Edebiyat Fakültesi Felsefe Bölümündeki akademisyenler olmak üzere tüm meslektaşlarıma ve katkıda bulunan tüm kurum ve kuruluşlara Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi adına teşekkür ediyor, bu çalışmanın dil, düşünce ve din bilimleri alanında bir ufuk çizmesini umut ediyorum.

Prof. Dr. İbrahim ÖZCOŞAR
Mardin Artuklu Üniversitesi Rektörü

ÖNSÖZ

Araştırmacıların yakından bildiği gibi bilimler temelde kavramlarla kurulur ve onlarla yol alırlar. Bu sebeple, bilimlerin günümüze kadarki süreçte kuruluş, yol alış ya da ilerleme serüvenleri, bir taraftan onların ilişkili oldukları kavramlara borçlu olduğunu, dolayısıyla sözkonusu ilerlemenin de ancak yeni kavramsal üretimlerle sürdürülebileceğini gösterirken; diğer taraftan kendilerine özgü kavramsal yüklerle herhangi bir bilimsel alanda üretimde bulunan düşünürleri kuramsal bir takım konumlara yerleştirerek onları birbirinden ayırır. Bu anlamda, her ne kadar her bilim kendi özgüllüğüne ve müstakillikğine sahip olsa da, onları, sosyal bilimlerin en belirgin üç araştırma sahası bakımından ayrıca kategorize etmek mümkündür: Dil, düşünce ve din bilimleri. Bu genel kategorilerde bir araya gelen bilimler, şu ya da bu bilim olsun, insana özgü bir eylem biçimine karşılık gelen araştırma alanları olarak karşımıza çıkmaktadır. Dil; gündelik iletişim ve gramatik tartışmalar kadar edebiyattan felsefi bilimlere uzanan geniş bir yelpaze içerisinde birçok alana sirayet eden bir çalışma sahasıdır. İnanç ise günlük yaşamda karşılaştığımız ve belli bir güvene dayalı bir inanma biçiminden doğa veya doğaüstü boyutlara ulaşan bir alanda daha çok metafizik, teoloji veya ilahiyat olarak ifadesini bulur. Her iki alanı ortak kesen düşünce ise bir taraftan insanın sistematik veya sistematik olmayan bütüncül düşünme eylemini ifade eden bir meta bakışı sunarken diğer taraftan ise genelde varlık, bilgi ve eylem üzerine yoğunlaşan bir disiplindir. Bununla birlikte, bu kategorilerden her biri şu ya da bu ölçüde diğerlerini de içerir. Buna göre dil, düşünce ve din, insanlığın hem evrensel hem de yerel boyutlarını kuşatan geniş bir ilişki ağında karşımıza çıkan temel araştırma alanlarıdır.

İnsana özgü bir eylem veya üretim biçimi olarak bilimlerin -kaba bir tasnifle bile- uzun bir zaman dilimine ve geniş bir yelpazeye yayılması, onlardan her birinin bu akışın öznesi olan insanın bir anına veya boyutuna tekabül ettiğini gösterir. Bu sebeple, elinizdeki ciltler, hem yukarıda sözkonusu edilen üç alanın metinlerinde işlenen veya bu alanların yaklaşımıyla üretilen yaşamsal tecrübeye dair kavramları ele almaya hem de bu işleyişin kavramsallaştırılması tecrübesini konu edinmeye çalışıyorlar. Bu temel plan eşliğinde ortaya konulan metinler, yalnızca dil, düşünce ve din bilimlerinin kurucu ve taşıyıcı kavramlarını yeniden incelemeyi değil, aynı zamanda her bir bilim için kenarda kalan bazı kavramları da araştırmacıların gündemine getirmeyi amaçlıyorlar.

Editörler

An Existentialist Approach to Jean-Paul Sartre's *No Exit*

Halit Alkan*

Introduction

As a European philosophical movement, existentialism¹ which is the philosophy of existence itself flourished around the middle of the 20th century. This philosophy declares that existence precedes essence. Human beings exist (are born) before they can construct values, meanings and identities on the basis of their consciousness. Human beings are responsible for making themselves into an essence. In this sense, of necessity, one must make choices, take actions and assume the consequences. Therefore, human beings are condemned to a life of freedom in which they must choose.

According to Tanzer, existentialism occupies a liminal position between the boundaries of philosophy and literature.² Being a French philosopher famous for his existentialist aspect, Jean-Paul Sartre (1905-1980) expresses that conscious beings are structured in such a way that their existence precedes their essence because “man first of all exists, encounters himself, surges up in the world – and defines himself afterwards”.³ In other words, human beings exist first and then they make choices. In their ontology, human beings are defined according to the things they choose to say and do. Therefore, as consciousness (of) being, human beings are totally responsible for their choices and actions as the natural result of a human's being free to choose. According to Sartre, human beings have a free choice in

* Dr., Mardin Artuklu University, English Language and Literature, alkan.halit@yahoo.com, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7170-6196>

¹ The theory of existentialism is retrieved from the article by Halit Alkan, “A Structuralist Analysis of Jean-Paul Sartre's *The Flies*”, *Artuklu Human and Social Science Journal*, 1/1 (2016): p.64-71. And this theory is also retrieved from the conference paper by Halit Alkan, “A Structuralist Analysis of Anton Chekhov's *The Lady with the Dog*”, *IV. International European Congress on Social Sciences*, 11-13 October 2019 Diyarbakir, ed., Zuhra Kalakhanova & Ali Söylemez, Ispec Publishing House (Istanbul: 2019), p.44-59.

² Mark Tanzer, *On Existentialism*, Belmont: Thomson Wordsworth, 2008, p.1.

³ Jean-Paul Sartre, *Existentialism is A Humanism*, New Haven: Yale University, 2007, p.23.

how to respond and how to act. Human beings are free to create what they will become. This sort of freedom is not easy for man to cope with because it creates forlornness for human beings: “I am abandoned in the world... in the sense that, engaged in a world for which I bear the whole responsibility without being able, whatever I do, tear myself away from this responsibility for an instant”.⁴ Freedom means responsibility and that freedom may be a burden because it also is a tremendous responsibility. Sartre believes that choice means hope which provides an opportunity to solve the problems and change the difficulties that human beings undergo.

Human beings accept that they have limitations, but they still try to act in the best way possible to control what is in their hands. “Anxiety puts you in the position to do that by overwhelming you in a mood that breaks you out of your immediacy and creates a space for you to once again ask those important questions”.⁵ This sort of anxiety senses the nothingness at the core of the world and human beings. Furthermore, the meanings which make up one’s world are accidental. Anxiety takes away the illusion that human beings made their life neat, clean, comfortable and in order. So, human beings are surrounded by nothingness. In this sense, anxiety shows human beings that they have the power to create themselves differently from the roles or meanings that their world assigns to them. Human beings can take hold of their own existence. In short, for the existentialists, nothingness means freedom to human beings.⁶ Therefore, there is no meaning to be found in the world beyond what meaning human beings give to it. However, life becomes absurd when human beings try to impose clarity to an irrational world. “The existentialists think that the world has no necessary structure, no intrinsic meaning, no innate meaning, no innate significance, no internal purpose whatsoever on its own”.⁷ Absurdity is a confrontation, an opposition or a conflict between two ideals. “The world in itself is not unreasonable, that is all can be said. But what is absurd is the confrontation of the irrational and the wild longing for clarity whose call echoes in the human heart”.⁸ While human beings wish for

⁴ Jean-Paul Sartre, *Existentialism and Human Emotions*, New York: Citadel, 1957, p.57.

⁵ Christopher Panza & Gregory Gale, *Existentialism*, Indiana: Wiley, 2008, 65.

⁶ Hilal Kaya, “A Comparative Study: Existentialism in *No Exit* by Jean Paul Sartre and *Shadowless* by Hasan Ali Toptaş”, *Folklor / Edebiyat*, 25/99, (2019/3), p.581.

⁷ Panza & Gale, *Existentialism*, p.79.

⁸ Albert Camus, *The Myth of Sisyphus and Other Essays*, trans., Justin O’Brien, New York: Vintage, 1991, p.19.

meaning and certainty, the world is indifferent or silent. Due to this confrontation, human condition is an absurd one.

Methodology

Jean-Paul Sartre focused originally on the individual in the society, on her/his innermost thoughts about freedom and anguish, on the concept of responsibility and consciousness. Sartre's concept of freedom is based on responsibility toward society and, naturally, toward one's own growing essence. He identifies the theory of freedom with that of human consciousness, showing that human beings must make their own choices, take actions, assume the consequences and establish their own standards of living. Sartre judged the concept of freedom and choice and even more significant was his idea of creating an order out of the chaos because his ideas were affected by the Spanish Civil War, the worldwide economic crisis, World War II and Germany's occupation of France. Sartre focused on the conflict between human's needs and hopes, and the meaningless universe into which humans are thrown.⁹ In "Being and Nothingness", Sartre's aspect of existentialism is that human being is condemned to be free and that there is no limit to human freedom except for the freedom itself.¹⁰ Human consciousness is not bound by natural laws: it can interpret them and decide how to act on them. The anguish which we feel when we are confronted with the vast and meaningless universe is something which Sartre calls "nausea". To combat this "nausea", man can use his freedom – the freedom of thought, choice, action. But once man has made a choice, acted upon his choice and taken its responsibility, there is no turning back. This choice stands as an imprint on his essence, on his human makeup, and it follows him for the rest of his days.

In terms of freedom, there are two kinds of beings: 'being as a subject' and 'being as an object'. Human's existence of freedom depends on the on-going relationships between these two aspects. In terms of 'being as a subject', human beings that are conscious beings are free by creating their own value system through choice, action and responsibility. In other words, those who are free ignore how others judge them. 'Being as an object' means that human beings give up the ability to judge themselves and create their own morals, and simply

⁹ Ayşegül Yüksel, *Drama Sanatında Ezgi ve Uyum*, İstanbul: Mitos-Boyut Yayınları, 2011, 111.

¹⁰ Jean-Paul Sartre, *Being and Nothingness*, New York: Washington Square Press, 1992, p.439.

rely on others' evaluations of them for guidance by letting others impose their morals on them. In this sense, like a stone, these human beings need the existence of others to have a meaning. In other words, one cannot act freely if s/he takes the judgment of others into consideration. This study aims to analyse Jean-Paul Sartre's *No Exit* (1944) in terms of existentialist approach, namely human's existence of freedom which depends on the on-going relationships between the aspects of 'being as a subject' and 'being as an object'. The play *No Exit* which includes these forms of existentialism depicts the afterlife in which Joseph Garcin, Ines Serrano and Estelle Rigault are locked into a room in hell together for eternity.

An Existentialist Approach to Jean-Paul Sartre's *No Exit*

The play *No Exit* is a depiction of the afterlife in which three damned souls, Joseph, Ines, and Estelle are brought one by one to the same room in hell by a mysterious Valet who is a representative of the devil. When Joseph, Inez and Estelle enter the room one by one, they think they will see those whom they killed and will be tortured for their sins. However, there are no medieval torture devices, no torturers and no victims to punish them for eternity. Instead, they find a singular room in hell with Second-Empire French furnishings, including three couches, a bronze mantelpiece, a paper knife and a bell. When Joseph enters the room, he says "No mirrors, I notice. No windows."¹¹ Beyond the door, there are simply more passages and more rooms. The space in hell is stable while the space in the real world is changeable. None of them will admit the reason for their damnation. Estelle denies that she belongs in Hell as she says, "I'm wondering if there hasn't been some ghastly mistake. Isn't it better to think we've got here by mistake?"¹²

When Joseph, Inez and Estelle enter the room, they bring together with them their story of action from the real world reflecting their 'being as a subject' because they are free and ignore how others judge them and create their own value system through choice, action and responsibility. Joseph who died a month ago is a journalist from Rio and the first to arrive in the room. He was shot by a firing squad as he refused to fight when war broke out. He does not question his damnation, easily recalling how awful he had been to his wife, constantly cheating on her and sometimes bringing women back to

¹¹ Jean-Paul Sartre, *In Camera and Other Plays (No Exit)*, trans., Stuart Gilbert, Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1990, p.4.

¹² Sartre, *In Camera and Other Plays (No Exit)*, p.14.

their house. It is a wonderful story to keep a man as 'being as a subject' forever. Inez is the second prisoner and also a lesbian. She had been a postal clerk and thinks that she is in hell for seducing her cousin's wife Florence while living with them. Later, Florence's husband died in a tram accident. Inez repeats the feeling of guilty for what they both had done to Florence's husband. Her guilty lover Florence who could no longer endure the lack of tranquility killed both herself and Inez by leaving the gas on while Inez was asleep. Her story keeps Inez as 'being as a subject' because of her skill in dragging people into destruction. Estelle who died a day ago is the third and final prisoner. She is a pretty blonde and is very interested in being feminine. Estelle was a poor girl whose parents died when she was young. She married a wealthy man three times her age to support her and her younger brother. Years later, though she found someone whom she could love, she refused to cheat on her husband, and died of pneumonia. It is an eminent story to keep a woman as 'being as a subject' forever.

Time moves differently in hell and on earth. The time on earth moves quickly. The inhabitants of hell can look back and witness scenes on earth, but only at the start of their stay. Joseph watches how his wife is given the clothes with bullet holes, her death of sorrow, his colleague, Gomez, talk about him to their friends. Joseph fears of being called a coward. Inez watches her old apartment get closed up and then rented out to a couple who makes love on her bed. Inez who was called a damned woman has no trace left on the earth. Estelle watches her friend, Olga, flirt with a boy who used to love Estelle. Olga tells every truth about Estelle to the boy and makes her nothing in the eyes of the boy. The 'being as a subject' of the three characters is judged by people on the earth and is reduced to the state of 'being as an object'. Each of them gets the unchangeable state by the judgment of others. Joseph will be remembered as a coward because he is shot for attempting to desert during the war. Estelle as a pretty blonde is the murderer of her child and crazy about money and males because she cheated on her husband, got pregnant, ran off to Switzerland to have the baby and then drowned it right before her lover's eyes. After her lover shot himself in the face, Estelle returned home to her husband as if nothing has happened. As for Inez, nobody will remember her at all. Each character fails to show responsibility toward society and, naturally, toward one's own growing essence. They soon lose all connections with earth and are forced to live entirely in hell where the time is stable and where they are completely

deprived of the freedom of existence as 'being as a subject' because they no longer have the opportunity to act, to change the thoughts about themselves.

They experience all emotions of angst, despair, and abandonment. After arguing they decide to confess to their crimes so they know what to expect from each other. In her dialogue with Joseph, Ines admits that "When I say I'm cruel, I mean I can't get on without making people suffer".¹³ In this space not having the mirror to show them as they wish, they can only see themselves through their reflections in others' eyes. The mirror of each is the 'other' two. There is a unique torture because their essence is determined by the look of the other. They are the prisoners of each other in the unchangeable space and time of the room. This imprisonment fixes them in the state 'being as an object' because they cannot act freely and take the judgment of others into consideration by letting others impose their morals on them to have a meaning. The lesbian Inez finds pretty blonde female Estelle very attractive and tries to seduce her. However, Estelle opposes being made an object by Inez and kisses male Joseph. On the other hand, Joseph tries to get in contact with Inez hoping to convince her and Estelle that he is not a coward when he asks Estelle, "Well, Estelle, am I a coward?"¹⁴ However, Estelle who does not want to be excluded will not allow this contact. In the room where the characters are imprisoned, they are not left on their own, cannot close their eyes, there is no nighttime and no sleep, they cannot kill themselves/other and cannot change the judgment about themselves.

Conclusion

The play *No Exit* is a depiction of the afterlife in which three damned souls, Joseph, Ines, and Estelle are brought one by one to the same room in hell by a mysterious Valet. When these three deceased characters enter the room one by one, they think they will see those whom they killed and will be tortured for their sins. However, there are no medieval torture devices, no torturers and no victims to punish them for eternity. The space in hell is stable while the space in the real world is changeable. When Joseph, Inez and Estelle enter the room, they bring together with them their story of action from the real world reflecting their 'being as a subject' because they are free and ignore

¹³ Sartre, *In Camera and Other Plays (No Exit)*, p.26.

¹⁴ Sartre, *In Camera and Other Plays (No Exit)*, p.37.

how others judge them and create their own value system through choice, action and responsibility. None of them will admit the reason for their damnation. While the time in hell is stable, the time on earth moves quickly. The inhabitants of hell can look back and witness scenes on earth, but only at the start of their stay. The 'being as a subject' of the three characters is judged by people on the earth and is reduced to the state of 'being as an object' which gets the unchangeable state by the judgment of others. Joseph will be remembered as a coward and Estelle as a pretty blonde who is the murderer of her child and crazy about money and males while nobody will remember Inez at all. Each character fails to show responsibility toward society and, naturally, toward one's own growing essence. They experience all emotions of angst, despair, and abandonment. They become the prisoners of each other in hell where the time is stable and where they are completely deprived of the freedom of existence of 'being as a subject' because they no longer have the opportunity to act and to change the thoughts about themselves.

In this space not having the mirror to show them as they wish, they can only see themselves through their reflections in others' eyes. The mirror of each is the 'other' two. There is a unique torture because their essence is determined by the look of the other. One's 'being as a subject' and freedom will always be threatened, simply by the others' gaze. Therefore, the victim changes every time and there are two tortures against it. They are the prisoners of each other in the unchangeable space and time of the room. This imprisonment fixes them in the state 'being as an object' because they cannot act freely and take the judgment of others into consideration by letting others impose their morals on them to have a meaning. Hell does not include torture devices or physical punishment, but the torment of those one cannot escape. So, hell is other people because they are both the torturers and the victims.

References

Alkan, Halit. "A Structuralist Analysis of Anton Chekhov's *The Lady with the Dog*". *IV. International European Congress on Social Sciences*, 11-13 October 2019 Diyarbakır, ed. Zuhra Kalakhanova & Ali Söylemez, Ispec Publishing House (Istanbul: 2019), 44-59.

Alkan, Halit. "A Structuralist Analysis of Anton Chekhov's *The Lady with the Dog*".

IV. *International European Congress on Social Sciences*, 11-13 October 2019 Diyarbakır, Ed. Zuhra Kalakhanova & Ali Söylemez. Işpec Publishing House (Istanbul: 2019), 44-59. Retrieved from https://d2c3043d-aa6a-4817-b60d-f9fb002a5ae2.filesusr.com/ugd/614b1f_8ab35acfb1b142028f02b6e0eb56f8dd.pdf

Camus, Albert. *The Myth of Sisyphus and Other Essays*. Trans., Justin O'Brien. New York: Vintage, 1991.

Kaya, Hilal. "A Comparative Study: Existentialism in *No Exit* by Jean Paul Sartre and *Shadowless* by Hasan Ali Toptaş". *Folklor / Edebiyat*, 25/ 99, (2019/3): 577-591.

Shadowless by Hasan Ali Toptaş". *Folklor / Edebiyat*, 25/ 99, (2019/3): 577-591.

Panza, Christopher & Gale, Gregory. *Existentialism*. Indiana: Wiley, 2008.

Sartre, Jean-Paul. *Being and Nothingness*. New York: Washington Square Press, 1992.

Sartre, Jean-Paul. *Existentialism and Human Emotions*. New York: Citadel, 1957.

Sartre, Jean-Paul. *Existentialism is A Humanism*. New Haven: Yale University, 2007.

Sartre, Jean-Paul. *In Camera and Other Plays (No Exit)*. trans. Stuart Gilbert. Harmondsworth: Penguin. 1990.

Tanzer, Mark. *On Existentialism*. Belmont: Thomson Wordsworth, 2008.

Yüksel, Ayşegül. *Drama Sanatında Ezgi ve Uyum*. Istanbul: Mitos-Boyut Yayınları, 2011.